

REPORT

OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY
INTO POLICE CONDUCT

TE KŌMIHANA TIROTIRO WHANONGA PIRIHIMANA



VOLUME 1



March 2007

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY INTO POLICE CONDUCT

Te Kōmihana Tirotiro Whanonga Pirihimana

Commissioners

from 18 February 2004 to 2 May 2005

Honourable James Bruce Robertson, *Chairperson*

Dame Margaret Clara Bazley DNZM

from 2 May 2005

Dame Margaret Clara Bazley DNZM

Title: Report of the Commission of Inquiry into Police Conduct

Volume 1

Author: Dame Margaret Bazley (Commission of Inquiry into Police Conduct)

Publisher: Commission of Inquiry into Police Conduct

Place of publication: Wellington, New Zealand

Date of publication: March 2007

ISBN 978-0-477-10033-5

March 2007

Contact agency:

Department of Internal Affairs

Te Tari Taiwhenua

PO Box 805

Wellington

New Zealand



**Commission of Inquiry into Police Conduct
Te Kōmihana Tiro tiro Whanonga Pirihimana**

26 March 2007

To His Excellency, The Honourable Anand Satyanand, Governor-General

Your Excellency

Letter of transmittal

Pursuant to the terms of the Order in Council dated 18 February 2004 and as amended by Order in Council dated 2 May 2005, given under the hand of Her Excellency, The Honourable Dame Silvia Cartwright, PCNZM, DBE, the then Governor-General of New Zealand, I now humbly submit my report for Your Excellency's consideration.

I have The Honour to be
Your Excellency's most obedient servant

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Margaret Bazley".

Dame Margaret Bazley, DNZM
Commissioner

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This report is the result of a long process of review and the analysis of an extensive amount of information. It reflects the hard work and commitment of those involved in the inquiry process. In particular I would like to acknowledge the work of key commission staff and advisers – my legal adviser, Mr Douglas White QC; counsel assisting, Ms Mary Scholtens QC and Mr Kieran Raftery; the Commission's executive officer, Ms Rebecca Boyack; and commission staff and advisers, Ms Emma Jeffs, Dr John Sinclair, and Mr Robert Buchanan.

I also acknowledge the contribution made by counsel and representatives of the parties who worked hard to ensure that I had the full range of information I required during the inquiry

I would also like to acknowledge the input of the Honourable Bruce Robertson and the very sound legal foundation for the inquiry that he established prior to his appointment to the Court of Appeal in May 2005.

I would like to particularly record my appreciation of the commitment of Commission staff and their dedication in seeing the inquiry through to its completion. The staff worked hard to assist me carry out the inquiry and to ensure the Commission could complete its tasks in the required time frames.

I would also like to acknowledge and thank those submitters who came forward to the Commission with information about their experiences of making complaints to the police. I am very aware of the impact that this experience had on those people and their courage in coming forward to assist the Commission.

I was also impressed with the quality of the people who appeared before me as police witnesses and independent experts and would like to thank them for their contribution to my inquiry.

Dame Margaret Bazley, DNZM
Commissioner



– TABLE OF CONTENTS – VOLUME 1

Acknowledgments

– COMMISSIONER’S OVERVIEW –	1
------------------------------------	----------

– EXECUTIVE SUMMARY –	5
------------------------------	----------

– RECOMMENDATIONS –	15
----------------------------	-----------

– 1 – INTRODUCTION AND CONTEXT	25
---------------------------------------	-----------

Events leading to establishment of the Commission	25
--	-----------

Commission of inquiry appointed	25
--	-----------

Initial Order in Council	26
------------------------------------	----

Order in Council of 2 May 2005	26
--	----

Course of the inquiry	27
------------------------------	-----------

Processes of the Commission	27
---------------------------------------	----

Use of terms	28
------------------------	----

Rulings and memoranda by the Commission	29
---	----

Parties to the inquiry	29
----------------------------------	----

Time span of the inquiry	30
------------------------------------	----

Police investigation files and other documents	30
--	----

Review of documents	31
-------------------------------	----

Legislative matters affecting the inquiry	31
---	----

Responses to the establishment of the Commission	32
--	----

Reporting	32
---------------------	----

Public expectations of the Commission and the police	33
---	-----------

– 2 – STANDARDS AND PROCEDURES FOR COMPLAINT INVESTIGATIONS	35
--	-----------

Introduction	35
---------------------	-----------

Complaints reviewed	37
----------------------------	-----------

Number of complaints	37
--------------------------------	----

<i>Complaints against police associates</i>	38
---	----

Outcomes of complaints	38
----------------------------------	----

<i>Outcomes of complaints against police associates</i>	39
---	----

Comment on the numbers and classification of complaints	40
General description of police policy structure	41
Adequacy of this system	44
Policy documents regarding internal investigations	45
Internal investigation policies, 1979–1989	46
<i>General instruction D129 regarding internal investigations</i>	47
<i>General instructions J80–J89</i>	48
<i>Refinement of general instructions J80–J89 in 1983</i>	50
Internal investigation policies, 1989–1994	52
<i>General instructions P281–P292</i>	52
<i>Revision of general instructions P281–P292</i>	54
<i>Prosecution guidelines</i>	55
Internal investigation policies 1994–2000	55
<i>General instructions IA 100–IA 132</i>	55
Internal investigation policies, 2000–2006	60
Adequacy of the internal investigation policies	63
Notification to the Commissioner of Police	63
Rights of the public when making a complaint	64
Ad hoc nature of policy development	65
Policies and procedures in respect of sexual assault allegations	66
Sexual assault investigation policies, 1979–1982	66
Sexual assault investigation policies, 1983–1986	68
Sexual assault investigation policies, 1986–1997	69
<i>Child Abuse Policy</i>	71
Sexual assault investigation policies, 1998–2006	71
<i>Adult Sexual Assault Investigation Policy</i>	72
<i>The revision of the Manual of Best Practice</i>	77
Adequacy of the sexual assault investigation policies	78
<i>Mandatory wording in the Adult Sexual Assault Investigation Policy</i>	80
<i>Aligning the Adult Sexual Assault Investigation Policy with the Manual of Best Practice</i> ...	81
<i>Resource planning for the ASAI Policy</i>	82
Communication of standards and procedures	83
Publication	83
Familiarity of front-line staff with investigation standards and procedures	84
Ensuring adequate communication	86
Training	87
Overall assessment of the adequacy of police standards and procedures	89
<i>Proliferation of policies</i>	89
<i>Standards and procedures regarding internal investigations</i>	89
<i>Implementation of the Adult Sexual Assault Investigation Policy</i>	90
<i>Communication and training</i>	90

– 3 – POLICE PRACTICE IN COMPLAINT INVESTIGATIONS	93
Introduction	93
PRACTICE IN INVESTIGATION OF SPECIFIC COMPLAINTS: CONSTRAINT ON INQUIRY	95
PRACTICE IN COMPLAINT INVESTIGATION	96
The process of making a complaint	97
Current practices for making and receiving complaints	98
<i>Making a complaint of sexual assault against a member of police</i>	98
<i>Making a complaint of sexual assault against an associate of the police</i>	101
Evidence of past practice when receiving a complaint	101
<i>Complaints against members of the police</i>	101
<i>Complaints against associates of the police</i>	102
Areas to be addressed	102
Appointing an investigating officer	103
Importance of independence	103
Importance of independence when investigating complaints involving police and associates .	104
Standards and procedures relating to independence	105
<i>Complaints involving police officers</i>	105
<i>Complaints involving police associates</i>	106
Current practice when appointing an investigator of a complaint against a police officer	107
<i>Relevant factors in making appointments</i>	108
<i>Evidence from the submitters' cases</i>	111
<i>Other examples from the Operation Loft files</i>	112
Practices involving police associates	114
<i>Current practice</i>	114
<i>Evidence of past practice</i>	114
Commission comment on independence of appointees	115
<i>Making appointments in urgent cases</i>	116
<i>Guidance on police associates</i>	116
Areas to be addressed	118
Conduct of a sexual assault investigation	120
Current best practice in sexual assault investigations	121
<i>Compliance with the ASAI Policy</i>	122
Evidence of police practice when undertaking an investigation	123
<i>Police practice in the investigation of submitters' complaints</i>	123
<i>Examples of police practice from the Operation Loft files</i>	132
Areas to be addressed	132
Exercise of the discretion to prosecute	133
Current practice governing the exercise of the discretion to prosecute	133
<i>Members of police</i>	134
<i>Associates of the police</i>	136
Evidence of police practice concerning the discretion to prosecute	136
Areas to be addressed	140

Communication and management of complaints	140
Communication with complainants	140
Relationship with sexual assault support groups	143
<i>Funding issues</i>	144
Complaint management	144
ENSURING COMPLIANCE WITH STANDARDS AND PROCEDURES	146
Monitoring the investigation of complaints against the police	146
Monitoring of complaints against police officers at district level	147
Monitoring of complaints against police officers at national level	149
Adequacy of the Professional Standards review mechanisms	150
Monitoring the investigation of complaints against associates of the police	151
National consistency, district autonomy, and constabulary independence	151
The Assurance Committee	153
Constabulary independence	153
Oversight of smaller and rural police stations	154
<i>Supervision and training of staff</i>	156
<i>Internal control and audit</i>	157
<i>Community relationships and feedback</i>	157
<i>National initiatives</i>	159
Adequacy of the management structures and systems	160
– 4 – POLICE INVESTIGATIONS ON BEHALF OF THE POLICE COMPLAINTS AUTHORITY	165
Scope of my inquiry in relation to the Police Complaints Authority	167
Current legislative context of the Police Complaints Authority	168
Functions of the Police Complaints Authority	168
<i>Powers of the PCA</i>	170
<i>PCA discretion regarding complaints</i>	172
Impact of the secrecy provisions on PCA investigations	174
Structure of the Police Complaints Authority	174
Number of complaints received	175
Interaction between the Police Complaints Authority and the police	176
Basis of the working relationship	176
Notification of a complaint	177
Directions from the PCA under section 17 of the PCA Act	179
<i>District Complaint Resolution</i>	180
Adequacy of police investigations on behalf of the PCA	181
PCA Involvement with complainants of sexual assault	182
Accessibility of the PCA	182
Communication between the PCA and the complainant	185
Delays in completing the investigation and notifying the complainant	187
Independent Police Complaints Authority Amendment Bill	187

Changes to the Police Complaints Authority proposed by the police	189
Views of the parties on the police proposal for changes to the PCA	190
My views on the proposal	191
– 5 – POLICE DISCIPLINARY ACTION	195
<hr/>	
The New Zealand Police disciplinary system	196
Disciplinary system for sworn staff	196
<i>Management-level disciplinary action</i>	197
<i>Police disciplinary tribunal</i>	198
Disciplinary system for non-sworn staff	199
Police disciplinary actions taken	200
Submissions received on aspects of the disciplinary system	202
The wider employment context	204
Issues arising in respect of the police disciplinary system for sworn staff	205
Cost and complexity of the system	206
Need for the complainant to be identified and to make formal complaint	206
Formality of the process and the high standard of evidence and proof	207
Time limits on bringing charges	209
Balance of protection	209
Separation of discipline from performance management	210
Disengagement	214
Adequacy of the current disciplinary system	217
My views on the system	219
Options for reform	219
Safeguarding procedural integrity and fairness	220
Interface with the complaints system	221
The case for interim reform	221
– 6 – STANDARDS AND CODES OF CONDUCT IN RELATION TO PERSONAL BEHAVIOUR	225
<hr/>	
Introduction	225
Existing codes of conduct	227
Corporate expressions of standards of personal behaviour	227
Police competency framework and core values	228
Expressions of values in corporate accountability documents	229
Sexual harassment	230
Sexual harassment policy and procedures	231
<i>Development of the policy</i>	231
<i>Resolving sexual harassment complaints</i>	233
<i>Processes for criminal offences</i>	233
Police records of sexual harassment complaints	234

Review of sexual harassment complaints in Operation Loft files	236
<i>Sexual harassment complaints in the 1980s</i>	236
<i>Sexual harassment complaints since 1990</i>	238
Improvements over time	243
Reluctance to take formal action	244
Current and future safety of women in the police workplace	245
Issues about the adequacy or effectiveness of standards	246
Standards of sexual conduct towards members of the public	246
<i>Personal vulnerability and power imbalance</i>	247
<i>Evidence of abuse of trust</i>	247
<i>Effects of such conduct</i>	251
<i>The need for standards on sexual conduct towards members of the public</i>	252
<i>Recommended approach</i>	255
Misuse of email and Internet by police	256
<i>Computer use policies, procedures, and monitoring</i>	256
<i>Police investigations of misuse of information technology</i>	258
Actions if standards and codes of conduct are not met	259
Performance management	259
Disciplinary action	261
Repeat breaches of standards	261
Police Initiatives to enhance standards of personal behaviour	263
Police leadership and management development initiatives	263
Ethics training	264
Recruit training	266
Ethics committees	267
Integrity Project	268
National early warning system	269
Development of a code of conduct for sworn members of police	272
<i>Benefits of a code of conduct</i>	273
<i>Overseas experience: code of ethics for the police in Northern Ireland</i>	273
<i>Other State sector codes of conduct in New Zealand</i>	274
<i>Development of a code of conduct for sworn police staff</i>	275
<i>Views on the need for a code of conduct</i>	278
<i>Effect of introducing a code of conduct without legislative change</i>	279
- 7 - POLICE ATTITUDES TO INVESTIGATIONS AND DISCLOSURE OF WRONGDOING	283
<hr/>	
Police culture	285
Features of police culture generally	285
<i>Strong bonding amongst colleagues</i>	286
<i>A male-oriented culture</i>	286
<i>Attitudes towards the use of alcohol</i>	287
<i>Dual standards with respect to on-duty and off-duty behaviour</i>	287
Implications of these features	287
Features of the New Zealand Police culture	288
<i>Serving police officers' views</i>	288
<i>Evidence from the files</i>	290
<i>Report by Hon Sir David Tompkins</i>	291
<i>Ethical culture within the police</i>	291

Evidence of inappropriate attitudes	292
<i>Stereotyped views of complainants</i>	292
<i>Culture of scepticism in dealing with complainants</i>	294
<i>Condoning or ignoring inappropriate sexual behaviour</i>	295
<i>A wall of silence from colleagues</i>	295
Fostering attitudes supportive of fair and rigorous investigations	296
<i>Positive leadership</i>	297
<i>Recruitment and advancement of women</i>	298
<i>A periodic external audit of culture</i>	299
Reporting knowledge of wrongdoing	299
Police policies on whistle-blowing	300
<i>General instruction IA 131</i>	300
<i>Protected Disclosures Act 2000</i>	300
<i>Police Complaints Authority Act 1988</i>	301
<i>General instructions IA121 and IA121A</i>	301
Adequacy of police instructions and policies on disclosure	302
Police practice on reporting of sexual misconduct	303
<i>Limitations of the evidence</i>	303
<i>Where a member knows of conduct that could amount to a criminal offence</i>	303
<i>Police practice regarding allegations and rumours</i>	304
Encouraging and supporting the reporting of allegations	305
– 8 – THE FUTURE	309
Police responses to the establishment of the Commission	309
Community engagement	312
Other external input and oversight	314
Involving other central government agencies	314
Implementing the reforms	315
Monitoring the implementation of change	316
Concluding comment	317
Index of Operation Loft files	319
Index of legislation	321
Index of organisations	322



– TABLE OF CONTENTS – VOLUME 2: APPENDICES

List of appendices	1
– APPENDIX 1 – TERMS OF REFERENCE	4
Appendix 1.1: Order in Council, 18 February 2004	4
Appendix 1.2: Order in Council, 2 May 2005	9
– APPENDIX 2 – PROCESSES OF THE COMMISSION	13
Commencement of the inquiry	13
<i>Parties to the inquiry and their legal representation</i>	13
<i>Commission’s first public meeting, 22 March 2004</i>	14
<i>Expressions of interest</i>	14
<i>Support for inquiry participants</i>	16
Clarification of the Commission’s initial approach	16
<i>Subjects of the original complaints</i>	17
<i>Amendment to the Police Complaints Authority Act</i>	17
<i>Interface between the Commission and the ongoing criminal investigations</i>	18
<i>Commission adjournment at 27 August 2004</i>	18
New directions to the Commission – May 2005 Order in Council	19
Police investigation files provided to the Commission	20
<i>Operation Loft files</i>	20
<i>Further information provided by the police</i>	21
Processes under the Commission’s revised mandate	22
<i>Commission hearings</i>	23
<i>Use of police files</i>	25
Summary of Commission processes since May 2005	25
Reporting process	26
– APPENDIX 3 – COMMISSION RULINGS AND MEMORANDA	28
Appendix 3.1: Commission ruling, 16 April 2004	29
Appendix 3.2: Commission ruling, 28 May 2004	35
Appendix 3.3: Commission ruling, 27 August 2004	38
Appendix 3.4: Commission ruling, 22 November 2005	56
Appendix 3.5: Commission memorandum, 15 December 2005	58
Appendix 3.6: Memorandum of advice, 15 February 2006	66
Appendix 3.7: Commission memorandum, 28 July 2006	75
Appendix 3.8: Commission memorandum, 13 October 2006	86
Appendix 3.9: Commission memorandum, 25 January 2007	110

– APPENDIX 4 – NEW ZEALAND POLICE: BACKGROUND INFORMATION AND RECENT INITIATIVES	115
Structure and operation of New Zealand Police	115
Police initiatives since the establishment of the Commission of Inquiry into Police Conduct . .	117
– APPENDIX 5 – WITNESSES APPEARING BEFORE THE COMMISSION	119
– APPENDIX 6 – SOURCE DOCUMENTS	121
– APPENDIX 7 – COMMISSION ESTABLISHMENT	123
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	126
NOTES FOR READERS	127